BEFORE THE UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION III 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-2029

)))

)

IN RE:

Novick Chemical Co., Inc. 705-709 Davis Street Scranton, Pennsylvania 18505 DOCKET NO. FIFRA-03-2008-0152

CONSENT AGREEMENT -TERMINATION OF ESTABLISHMENT REGISTRATION NUMBER

Respondent

CONSENT AGREEMENT

Preliminary Statement

This Consent Agreement is entered into by the Director of the Waste and Chemicals Management Division, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency - Region III ("EPA" or "Complainant") and Novick Chemical Co., Inc. ("Respondent") pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide and Rodenticide Act ("FIFRA"), *as amended*, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a), and Sections 22.13(b) and .18(b) of the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits ("Consolidated Rules of Practice"), 40 C.F.R. § 22.13(b) and .18(b). This Consent Agreement and the attached Final Order (hereinafter jointly referred to as the "CAFO") resolve Complainant's civil penalty claims against the Respondent under FIFRA arising from the violation of FIFRA alleged herein.

General Provisions

- 1. For purposes of this proceeding only, Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth in this CAFO.
- 2. Except as provided in paragraph 1, above, Respondent neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations and conclusions of law set forth in this CAFO.
- 3. Respondent agrees not to contest the jurisdiction of the EPA with respect to the execution of this Consent Agreement, the issuance of the attached Final Order, or the enforcement of the CAFO.
- 4. For the purposes of this proceeding only, Respondent hereby expressly waives any right to contest any issue of law or fact set forth in this Consent Agreement and any right to appeal the accompanying Final Order.

- 5. Respondent consents to the issuance of this CAFO and agrees to comply with its terms.
- 6. Respondent shall bear its own costs and attorney's fees.

EPA's Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law

- 7. In accordance with the Consolidated Rules at Sections 22.13(b) and .18(b)(2) and (3), Complainant alleges the following findings of fact and conclusions of law:
 - a. Respondent is a "person" within the meaning of Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C.
 § 136(s), and is subject to civil penalties pursuant to Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(1).
 - At all times relevant to the violation alleged herein, Respondent operated an active pesticide producing "establishment" as that term is defined by Section 2(dd) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(dd), located at 705-709 Davis Street, Scranton, Pennsylvania. This establishment is registered with EPA under Establishment Number 039020-PA-001.
 - c. At all times relevant to the violation alleged herein, Respondent was a "producer" as defined at Section 2(w) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(w), and 40 C.F.R. § 167.3.
 - d. Section 7(c)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136e(c)(1), provides, *inter alia*, that a producer operating a registered establishment is required to submit annually a pesticide production report to EPA stating the types and amounts of pesticides:
 (A) which the producer is currently producing; (B) which the producer has produced during the past year; and (C) which the producer has sold or distributed during the past year.
 - e. 40 C.F.R. § 167.85(d) requires that a producer operating a registered establishment submit its pesticide production report (EPA Form 3540-16) annually for the preceding calendar year on or before March 1 of each year, even if the producer has produced no pesticidal product for that reporting year.
 - f. Section 12(a)(2)(L) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(L), provides that it is unlawful for any person who is a producer to violate any provisions of Section 7 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136e.
 - g. Respondent was required to submit to EPA by March 1, 2007, a pesticide production report (EPA Form 3540-16) concerning its production, sales, and distribution of pesticides during calendar year 2006.
 - h. Respondent failed to submit its pesticide production report for calendar year 2006 on or before March 1, 2007.

- Respondent's failure to timely submit its pesticide production report for calendar year 2006 on or before March 1, 2007 constitutes a violation of Section 7 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136e, and therefore, an unlawful act under Section 12 (a)(2)(L) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(L).
- j. Respondent is a "distributor" subject to the assessment of a civil penalty under Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a)(1).
- k. Under the *FIFRA Section 7(c) Enforcement Response Policy* (February 10, 1986), EPA may, in its discretion, reduce a civil penalty to zero when a producer that produces no pesticides in a given calendar year fails to submit a timely production report under Section 7(c)(1) of FIFRA for that year, if such producer requests termination of the establishment's registration number within 20 days after a civil Complaint for such violation has been issued.
- 1. In correspondence provided prior to the issuance of a civil Complaint, Respondent stated that it had produced no pesticides in calendar year 2006 and requested that its Establishment Registration Number be terminated.

<u>Settlement</u>

- 8. In settlement of the above-captioned action, the parties hereto have agreed to the assessment of a civil penalty in the amount of \$ 0.00.
- 9. The aforesaid settlement amount is based upon Complainant's consideration of a number of factors, including, but not limited to, the statutory factors set forth in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(4), *i.e.*, the size of Respondent's business, the effect of the penalty on Respondent's ability to continue in business, and the gravity of the violations. These factors were applied to the particular facts and circumstances of this case with specific reference to EPA's *FIFRA Enforcement Response Policy* ("*ERP*"), dated July 2, 1990, the *FIFRA Section 7(c) Enforcement Response Policy*, dated February 10, 1986, and the *Modifications to EPA Penalty Policies to Implement the Civil Monetary Penalty Inflation Adjustment Rule (Pursuant to the Debt Collection Improvement Act of 1996, <i>Effective October 1, 2004)*, dated September 21, 2004.

Certification

10. Respondent certifies by its signature herein that it is currently in compliance with all applicable requirements of FIFRA § 7, 7 U.S.C. § 136e.

Other Applicable Laws

11. Nothing in this CAFO shall relieve Respondent of its obligation to comply with all applicable federal, state, and local laws and regulations.

Reservation of Rights

12. This CAFO resolves only EPA's civil claims for penalties for the specific violation alleged in this Consent Agreement. EPA reserves the right to commence action against any person, including Respondent, in response to any condition which EPA determines may present an imminent and substantial endangerment to the public health, public welfare, or the environment. In addition, this settlement is subject to all limitations on the scope of resolution and to the reservation of rights set forth in Section 22.18(c) of the Consolidated Rules of Practice. Further, EPA reserves any rights and remedies available to it under FIFRA, the regulations promulgated thereunder, and any other federal laws or regulations for which EPA has jurisdiction, to enforce the provisions of this CAFO, following its filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

Full and Final Satisfaction

13. The filing of the Final Order with the Regional Hearing Clerk shall constitute full and final satisfaction of all civil claims for penalties which Complainant may have under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a), for the specific violation alleged in this CAFO. Compliance with this CAFO shall not be a defense to any action commenced at any time for any other violation of the federal laws and regulations administered by EPA.

Parties Bound

14. This CAFO shall apply to and be binding upon the EPA, the Respondent, and the officers, directors, successors, and assigns of Respondent. By his or her signature below, the person signing this Consent Agreement on behalf of Respondent is acknowledging that he or she is fully authorized by the party represented to execute this Consent Agreement and to legally bind Respondent to the terms and conditions of this CAFO.

Effective Date

15. The effective date of this CAFO is the date on which the Final Order, signed by the Regional Administrator of EPA -- Region III, or his designee, the Regional Judicial Officer, is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice.

Entire Agreement

16. This CAFO constitutes the entire agreement and understanding of the Parties concerning settlement of the above-captioned action and there are no representations, warranties, covenants, terms, or conditions agreed upon between the Parties other than those expressed herein.

For Respondent:

Date

For Complainant:

0 2008

Date

Edward Novick, President Novick Chemical Co., Inc.

winners ne

Kyla Townsend-McIntyre / Pesticides/Asbestos Programs & Enforcement Branch

Accordingly, I hereby recommend that the Regional Administrator or his designee issue the Final Order attached hereto.

12008

Date

for AF

Abraham/Ferdas, Director Waste and Chemicals Management Division

BEFORE THE UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION III 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-2029

IN RE:)
)
Novick Chemical Co., Inc.)
705-709 Davis Street).
Scranton, Pennsylvania, 18505)
)
Respondent)

DOCKET NO. FIFRA-03-2008-0152

FINAL ORDER

FINAL ORDER

Complainant, the Director of the Waste and Chemicals Management Division, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency - Region III, and Respondent, Novick Chemical Co., Inc., have executed a document entitled "Consent Agreement", which I hereby ratify as a Consent Agreement in accordance with the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits, 40 C.F.R. Part 22 ("Consolidated Rules of Practice"). The terms of the foregoing Consent Agreement are accepted by the undersigned and incorporated into this Final Order as if fully set forth at length herein.

NOW, THEREFORE, PURSUANT TO Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, *as amended*, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a) ("FIFRA"), and the Consolidated Rules of Practice, and having determined based on the parties' representation in the Consent Agreement that the penalty agreed to in the Consent Agreement is based on a consideration of the factors set forth in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a)(4), IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that a \$ 0.00 penalty be assessed against Respondent. The effective date of the foregoing Consent Agreement and this Final Order is the date on which this Final Order is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

<u>5/15/08</u> Date

Salajian eré Renée Sarajian

Regional Judicial Officer U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region III



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY **REGION III** 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-2029

IN RE:	, ,	
	:	DOCKET NO. FIFRA-03-2008-0152
Novick Chemical Co., Inc. 705-709 Davis Street	• • •	CONSENT AGREEMENT
Scranton, Pennsylvania 18505	:	
Respondent	:	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that the original of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order for the above-referenced matter were hand-delivered to the Regional Hearing Clerk, EPA Region III, and that true and correct copies were mailed via certified mail to the following persons:

> Edward Novick, President Novick Chemical Co. Inc. 705-709 Davis Street Scranton, Pennsylvania 18505

L. Joursend Mes

Kýla L. Townsend-McIntyre Énforcement Officer U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region III

116/2008